Validated screening tools for common mental disorders in low and middle income countries: A systematic review

Gemma-Claire Ali* 1, 2, Grace Ryan 3, 2 and Mary J De Silva 4, 2

 $^{\mathrm{1}}$ Department of Public Health and Primary Care, University of Cambridge, Cambridge, UK

² Centre for Global Mental Health, London, UK

³ Department of Population Health, London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine, London,

UK

⁴ Department of Population, Environment and Health, Wellcome Trust, London, UK

*Corresponding author: Gemma-Claire Ali

gemmaclaire.ali@gmail.com

Supplementary Document: Tables 1-5.

Table 1. Quality Criteria

- Was expectation bias avoided?
 (Were people administering the diagnostic interview blind to the results of the screening tool, and vice versa?)
- 2) Was work-up bias avoided? (Did positive and negative screens have an equal chance of receiving the full diagnostic interview?)
- 3) Was a sensible 'normal range' derived from the results? (Was ROC analysis used to identify the most appropriate cut-off point?)
- 4) Was the tool appropriately translated, adapted and/or designed for the study setting and population? (If using an existing tool, did authors employ the standardised WHO translation protocol [1]?)
- 5) Were confidence intervals given for AUC, sensitivity, specificity and other features of the test?
- 6) Was the tool shown to be reproducible both within and/or between observers? (Was test-retest and/or inter-rater reliability assessed?)

Table 2. Disorders for which screening tools were validated by studies included in this review

Common Mental Disorders (63 studies)	Any common mental disorder, comprising one or more of the disorders listed below.	
	Dysthemia	
	Any depressive disorder	
Depressive Disorders	Major depressive disorder	
(174 studies)	Antenatal depression	
	Postnatal depression	
	Postnatal major depressive disorder	
	Any anxiety disorder	
Anxiety Disorders	Generalised anxiety disorder	
(24 studies)	Social anxiety disorder	
	Panic disorder	
Post-traumatic stress disorder (12 studies)	Post-traumatic stress disorder	

Table 3. Number of validation studies for each population group

Population		Number of Studies	
Child & Adolescent		17	
Perinatal	Antenatal	9	
	Postnatal	27	
	Clinic attendees	34	
Adult	HIV+	6	
	Physically ill	9	
	Mentally ill	8	
	Trauma survivors	5	
	General population	20	
	University students	8	
Elderly		15	
Total		158	
		(5 of the 153 studies sampled from populations	
		representing two of the above groups)	

Table 4. Number of validation studies by subregion and country

Region (# studies)		Countries Included (# studies)		
Africa (40)	Central (1)	Cameroon (1) 7 LMIC countries with 0 studies		
	East (19)	Burundi (2), Ethiopia (3), Malawi (1), Rwanda (1), Somalia (1), Uganda (4), Zambia (4), Zimbabwe (3) 11 LMIC countries with 0 studies		
	North (3)	Egypt (2), Morocco (1) 5 LMIC countries with 0 studies		
	South(8)	Botswana (1), South Africa (7) 3 LMIC countries with 0 studies		
	West (9)	Burkina Faso (1), Nigeria (8) 15 LMIC countries with 0 studies		
America (46)	Caribbean (0)	17 LMIC countries with 0 studies		
	Central (3)	Honduras (1), Mexico (2) 6 LMIC countries with 0 studies		
	South(43)	Brazil (33), Chile (1), Colombia (8), Peru (1) 7 LMIC countries with 0 studies		
Asia (66)	Central (1)	Tajikistan (1) 4 LMIC country with 0 studies		
	East (16)	China (15), Mongolia (1) 1 LMIC country with 0 studies		
	South (23)	Bangladesh (1), India (12), Iran(4), Nepal (2), Pakistan (1), Sri Lanka (3) 3 LMIC countries with 0 studies		
	Southeast (18)	Malaysia (7), Thailand (7), Vietnam (4) 6 LMIC countries with 0 studies		
	West (8)	Lebanon (3), Turkey (5) 8 LMIC countries with 0 studies		
Europe	East (0)	6 LMIC countries with 0 studies		
(1)	South(1)	Bosnia & Herzegovina (1) 5 LMIC countries with 0 studies		
C	Oceania (0)	16 LMIC countries with 0 studies		
	OTAL (153)	102 LMIC countries with 0 studies		

Table 5. Weighted diagnostics odds ratios (DORs) of selected screening tools

Screening Tool	Disorder	Number of Studies	Weighted DOR (excluding outliers)
GHQ-5	*CMD*	*2*	*59.82*
SRQ-20	CMD	14	28.36
GHQ-12	CMD	13	22.59
K-6	CMD	2	15.61
K-10	CMD	2	15.55
GHQ-28	CMD	2	15.31
SSQ	CMD	2	9.37
EPDS	CMD	3	7.01
HADS-D	Depressive disorders	8	33.07
PHQ-9	Depressive disorders	5	27.52
PHQ-2	Depressive disorders	2	22.18
BDI	Depressive disorders	2	16.14
EPDS	Depressive disorders	3	4.95
ZSDS	Major depressive disorder	4	36.47
GDS-15	Major depressive disorder	4	31.97
HADS-D	Major depressive disorder	3	22.77
PHQ-9	PHQ-9 Major depressive disorder		19.22
CES-D	Major depressive disorder	6	18.79
BDI	Major depressive disorder	4	15.18
K-10	Major depressive disorder	3	8.58
EPDS	*Postnatal major depressive disorder*	*4*	*172.70*
EPDS	*Postnatal depression*	*13*	*148.68*
EPDS	Antenatal depression	4	16.14
HADS-A	*Anxiety disorders*	*8*	*60.09*

Screening tool validity = *Very strong*, strong, fair, weak